

**ARIZONA BOARD OF APPRAISAL**  
1400 West Washington, Suite 360  
Phoenix, Arizona 85007  
(602)542-1539 FAX (602)542-1598  
Web Site: www.appraisal.state.az.us

**MINUTES**  
**REGULAR BOARD MEETING**  
**THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 18, 2008, 9:00 AM.**

Board Members Present at Roll Call: Les Abrams, Gabe Corral; Myra Jefferson, Michael Marquess, Debbie Rudd. A quorum was present. Board Members Present after Roll Call: None. Board Members Absent: Victor Hartsfield, Cynthia Henry. Vacant Board Member Positions: Certified General Appraiser; Public.

Also Present at Roll Call: Beckie Loar, Regulatory Compliance Administrator; Angenique Castaneda, Accounting Specialist; Jeanne Galvin, Assistant Attorney General.

Les Abrams acted as Chairperson.

The Board pledged allegiance to the flag of the United States of America.

Myra Jefferson moved that the Minutes of the August 21, 2008, Regular Board Meeting be approved. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

**PUBLIC ANNOUNCEMENTS AND CALL TO PUBLIC**

None.

**COMPLAINT REVIEW**

Review and Action Concerning 2434, Thomas M. Kittelmann.

Respondent's mentor appeared. Michael Marquess moved that the Consent Agreement and Order be amended to accept an affidavit or separate signature page on the appraisals. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The motion was withdrawn. Debbie Rudd moved that the Consent Agreement and Order (and future Consent Agreements and Orders in other actions) be amended to provide that if the client will not accept the signature of a supervisory appraiser, that the mentor must perform a Standard 3 Review and any problems be corrected in the appraisal prior to the delivery to the client. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 1625/1626/1888/1889/1890, James D. Schofield.

Respondent appeared. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Respondent in compliance and that the probation and mentorship be terminated. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2689/2690/2691/2692, William L. Brennan.

Respondent appeared. Debbie Rudd recused herself. A quorum did not remain and no action was taken.

Review and Action Concerning 2710, Diane E. Waring.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level III violations and offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order citing the violations and providing for probation, mentorship and education. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2378, Michael Santana.

Respondent appeared. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board amend the Consent Agreement and Order terminating the mentorship, and requiring additional education and the audit of two additional appraisals after 60 days. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2687, Kevin D. Kenski.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level I violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of concern citing the violations. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2680, Ambrose Rojas.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board go into Executive Session for legal advice. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Upon return from Executive Session, Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level I violations and offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order citing the violations and providing for no credit for the trainee because a notification of engagement of supervising trainee had not been filed with the Board. The motion failed for the lack of a second. Michael Marquess moved that the Board find Level I violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of concern citing the violations. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2715, William M. Nold.

Respondent did not appear. Complainant appeared. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the matter be referred to investigation. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2508, Theodore R. Wall.

Respondent appeared. Gabe Corral moved that the Board accept the remedial education late and that the file be closed. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2311/2312/2313/2314/2315, Shahab A. Mehkri.

Respondent did not appear. Upon its 12-month file review, the Board instructed staff to proceed with the formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH).

Review and Action Concerning 2321, Thomas J. Dozier.

Respondent did not appear. Upon its 12-month file review, the Board instructed staff to proceed with the formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH).

Review and Action Concerning 2418, Lance R. Freeman.

Respondent did not appear. Upon its 12-month file review, the Board instructed staff to proceed with the formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH).

Review and Action Concerning 2444, Dawna (Rogers) Khoudepaz.

Respondent did not appear. Upon its 12-month file review, the Board instructed staff to proceed with the formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH).

Review and Action Concerning 2452, Dana A. Miller.

Respondent did not appear. Upon its 12-month file review, the Board instructed staff to proceed with the formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH).

Review and Action Concerning 2453, Jaime Topete.

Respondent did not appear. Upon its 12-month file review, the Board instructed staff to proceed with the formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH).

Review and Action Concerning 2488, Richard A. Webb.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that staff write Judge Klein requesting that he make revocation of Respondent's real estate appraiser license part of the sentencing order pursuant to A.R.S. § 13-603(G). Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning Superior Court Case CV-06-4140 (03F-1782-BOA/03F-1784-BOA)/2492, Felicia M. Coplan.

Respondent did not appear. Jeanne Galvin provided a status update to the Board concerning CV-06-4140 (03F-1782-BOA/03F-1784-BOA). The Board took no action concerning 2492.

Review and Action Concerning 2571, Mark L. Huffman.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report with exceptions. The motion was withdrawn. Gabe Corral moved that the Board return the investigative report to the investigator for clarification. The motion failed for the lack of a second. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report with exceptions. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level I violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of concern citing the violations. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2574, Lyle F. Gallagher.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2575, Rosalie Mohr.

Respondent did not appear. Michael Marquess moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2576, Clare A. Williamson-Redding.

Respondent did not appear. Michael Marquess moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Michael Marquess moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2583/2584/2651, Shahab A. Mehkri.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative reports. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board refer 2583/2584 to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH) to be heard with 2311/2312/2313/2314/2315. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find no violations in 2651 and that the matter be dismissed. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2585, Scott J. Reischl.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the investigative report be returned to the investigator for correction of typographical errors. The motion was withdrawn. Gabe Corral moved that the investigative report be returned to the investigator for clarification. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Jeanne Galvin left the meeting.

Review and Action Concerning 2586, Mark L. Andrews.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Gabe Corral moved that the matter be referred to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2587, Alan Weiner.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2591, Martin A. Riley.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2597, Eric S. Gow.

Respondent did not appear. Michael Marquess moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Michael Marquess moved that the Board find no violations and the matter be dismissed. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2428/2429/2430, Douglas E. Grever.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that because Respondent's 90-day renewal grace period had expired, that the complaints be closed to be reopened and considered in the event Respondent reapplied. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2513/2514, John Ugrotzi, Jr.

Respondent did not appear. Les Abrams moved that the Board accept the substitute education to comply with the 6/24/08 Consent Agreement and Order. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted 2-3 against the motion. Gabe Corral, Myra Jefferson and Michael Marquess voted no. Gabe Corral moved that the Board not accept the substitute education to comply with the 6/24/08 Consent Agreement and Order. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted 3-2 in favor of the motion. Les Abrams and Debbie Rudd voted no. Gabe Corral moved that the Board grant Respondent a 90-day extension to complete the education. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2537, David M. Hossfeld.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board approve Daniel D. Smith, Certified Residential Appraiser # 20058, to act as Respondent's mentor. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2555, Kandace L. Levi.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the Consent Agreement and Order signed late. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2572, Jennifer A. Carpenter.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the substitute education to comply with the 5/27/08 due diligence consent letter. Michael seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2650, Collin H. Lord.

Respondent did not appear. Gabe Corral recused himself. A quorum did not remain and no action was taken.

Review and Action Concerning 2667, Chad R. Talbert.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Michael Marquess moved that the Board find Level III violations and offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order citing the violations and providing for probation, mentorship and education. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2679, Jason M. Maze.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board refer the matter to investigation. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2682, Phillip W. Empey.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Michael Marquess moved that the Board find no violations and that the matter be dismissed. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Jeanne Galvin rejoined the meeting.

Review and Action Concerning 2683, Christine J. Kelsey-Gray.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Michael Marquess moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2686, Nicki A. Flores.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing violations and providing for remedial education. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2688, Dana H. Volmer.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summaries were read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2708, Robert H. Baker/2709, Patricia A. Cook.

Respondents did not appear. Staff summaries were read. Michael Marquess moved that the matters be referred to investigation. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2711, Thomas A. Rail.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Michael Marquess moved that the matter be referred to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2712/2713, Darrell R. Martin.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summaries were read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level I violations concerning 2712 and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of concern citing violations. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that 2713 be referred to investigation. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2714, Richard L. Trimble.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2716, David M. Lyons/2717, William A. Barnes.

Respondents did not appear. Staff summaries were read. Debbie Rudd moved that the matters be referred to investigation. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2718, Thomas R. Lamb.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Michael Marquess moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2719, Jay A. Josephs.

Respondent did not appear. Michael Marquess recused himself. A quorum did not remain and no action was taken.

**BOARD CHAIRPERSON REPORT**

None.

**EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORT**

Rebecca Loar advised the complaint answer dates that had been extended by staff. The following are the complaint statistics as of 8/31/08 for calendar years 2006, 2007, and 2008:

	<u>2006</u>	<u>2007</u>	<u>2008</u>	<u>2007</u>	<u>2008</u>
Complaints received by Board	209	243	187		
Complaints heard by Board				619	585
<b><u>OF THOSE COMPLAINTS:</u></b>					
Complaints dismissed	73	91	40	98	52
Complaints referred to investigation	84	94	39	116	54
Complaints resolved with nondisciplinary letter of concern	30	16	8	20	10
Complaints resolved with nondisciplinary letter of remedial action	11	19	12	18	19
Complaints resolved with disciplinary letter of due diligence	6	12	2	9	8
Complaints resolved with probation	53	48	4	44	49
Complaints referred to informal hearing	67	72	2	79	35
Complaints referred to formal hearing	40	42	3	32	42
Complaints resolved with suspension	28	7	1	4	29
Complaints resolved with surrender	2	2	1	2	2
Complaints resolved with revocation	2	4	0	4	2
Complaints resolved with cease and desist letters	24	6	0	4	4
<b><u>Violation Levels:</u></b>					
I	35	21	10	25	13
II	11	30	14	23	27
III	22	46	3	41	32
IV	4	8	1	6	5
V	33	6	0	5	25
<b><u>Additional Information:</u></b>					
	<u>2005</u>	<u>2006</u>	<u>2007</u>	<u>2008</u>	
Jurisdiction Expired & Complaints Closed	21	20	12	8	
Denials of New Applications	5	7	7	4	
Denials of Renewal Applications	2	4	1	0	



## **APPLICATION REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT**

Debbie Rudd reported the following Arizona appraiser and property tax agent information as of September 17, 2008:

	<u>9/06</u>		<u>9/07</u>		<u>9/08</u>
Licensed Residential	1038		1136		939
Certified Residential	917		1040		1186
Certified General	756		791		813
Nonresident Temporary	67	Total 2778	31	Total 2998	38 Total 2976
Property Tax Agents	307		262		287

Michael Marquess moved that the Board accept the Committee's recommendations (see attached). Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Gabe Corral moved that the Board go into Executive Session to discuss confidential records concerning certified residential application #7051, Michael J. Bader. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Upon return from Executive Session, Michael Marquess moved that the Board find certified residential application #7051, Michael J. Bader, substantively incomplete. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Gabe Corral moved that the Board deny certified general application #7554, Colin Gennett, pursuant to A.R.S. §32-3614(B), A.R.S. §32-3605(B)(2), (A.A.C.) R4-46-201(A), and A.R.S. § 32-3620(A). Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

## **APPRAISAL TESTING AND EDUCATION COMMITTEE REPORT**

Michael Marquess moved that the Board accept the Committee's recommendations (see attached). Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

## **NEW BUSINESS**

### Discussion and Action Concerning Approval of Reciprocal Agreement with the Pennsylvania State Board of Certified Real Estate Appraisers.

Michael Marquess moved that the Board approve the reciprocal agreement. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

### Discussion and Action Concerning Approval of Proposed Substantive Policy Statement Concerning the Use of Qualifying Education to Count Toward Continuing Education.

Debbie Rudd moved that Jeanne Galvin research the proposed Substantive Policy Statement further. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Discussion and Action Regarding Amended Appraisal Subcommittee Policy Statement 10(G), Validation of Experience Documentation for AQB Criteria Conformance and USPAP Compliance.

Michael Marquess moved that the Board rescind its prior nondisciplinary consent agreement and orders placing practice restrictions on certified general appraisers relative to residential appraisals and that the nondisciplinary consent agreement and orders no longer be required as of November 1, 2008. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

**CONFIRMATION OF MEETING DATES, TIMES, LOCATIONS AND PURPOSES**

The upcoming Committee and Board meetings were confirmed as follows:

**October**

15	Application Review Committee	9:00 a.m.
16	Appraisal Testing and Education Committee	7:30 a.m.
16	Board	9:00 a.m.

**ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned.

/S/

Lester G. Abrams, Chairperson

**RECOMMENDATIONS  
COMMITTEE ON APPLICATION REVIEW**

**To: Board of Appraisal**

**From: Application Review Committee**

**Date: September 18, 2008**

**Re: September 17, 2008 Recommendations**

**I. Report on number of Arizona Appraisers and Property Tax Agents:**

	<u>9/06</u>		<u>9/07</u>		<u>9/08</u>
Licensed Residential	1038		1136		939
Certified Residential	917		1040		1186
Certified General	756		791		813
Nonresident Temporary	67	Total 2778	31	Total 2998	38
Property Tax Agents	307		262		287
					Total 2976

**II. As a result of its **September 17, 2008** meeting the Application Review Committee makes the following recommendations:**

**A. To refer the following applications to the full Board:**

7051 Michael J. Bader

**B. To deny the following applications:**

7554 Colin Gennett

**C. To take no action regarding additional information provided by:**

20981 Carol E. Lain

**D. No action taken:**

20957 Julie D. Friess  
30031 Bruce D. Greenberg  
30140 Don M. Baker II

**E. To approve the following applications as substantively complete:**

**1. Renewal applications:**

21159 Harry A. Wyman  
31107 Steven A. Zenker

**2. Licensed Residential by exam unless noted otherwise:**

7519 Daniel A. Colica  
7521 Danielle Cobb

**3. Certified Residential by exam unless otherwise noted:**

7017 Michael J. Heaton  
7460 Tomas E. Rivera  
7157 James M. Moore  
7221 Trent M. Ramsperger  
7255 Mark S. Captain  
7277 Kevin P. Grant  
7284 Thorley B. Taggart  
7304 Steven W. Merriott  
7308 Thomas M. Boneff  
7332 James A. Borst  
7444 Veronica M. Whitman  
7506 Sonja A. Terry  
7508 Nicholas A. Mowan  
7520 Dirk W. Hannon  
7523 Eric D. Heaton  
7530 Kenneth W. Smith  
7532 Tyler S. Campbell  
7533 Christine R. MacDonald  
7535 Lori L. Lucero  
7537 Stephen W. Jones  
7539 Norman L. Graham  
7540 Brad M. Ferguson

**F. To approve the following applications as substantively complete and confirm the issuance of the following license/certification:**

**1. Reciprocity**

11996 James J. May  
21937 Sherry A. Oncale  
21938 Jacqueline M. Foti

31664 William A. Dean  
31668 Ryan B. O'Neill  
31671 Jonathan D. Chapman  
31672 David G. Pope

## **2. Nonresident Temporary**

TP41110 James G. Moher

### **G. To disapprove the following applications as substantively incomplete and hold until substantively complete:**

7144 Bobby O. Hibbits  
7194 Lisa A. McManus  
7510 Lynn A. Betz  
7525 Gregory M. Mollohan  
7531 Carolanne Doherty (by reciprocity)  
7543 Cheryl A. Zormeier  
7544 Matthew G. Mortenson  
7545 Gina R. Wallen  
7546 Eric S. Gow  
7547 Monica L. Henretta  
7548 Lisa L. Stremme  
7549 Ryan M. Wood  
7550 Lori A. Lingle  
7551 Catherine N. Zeibig  
7552 Laura A. Koury  
7553 Randolph J. Still  
7555 Glen A. Gray, Jr.  
7556 Shannon W. Stone  
7558 Christine J. Kelsey-Gray  
7559 Stephen F. Hobbs  
7561 Steve E. Porter (by reciprocity)  
7563 Gabriel R. Riveras

### **III. Applications Pending - Substantively Incomplete**

6953 Daniel J. Kennedy (by reciprocity)  
6998 Stephen Rich (by reciprocity)  
7123 Todd S. Reiser  
7200 Larry E. Roush  
7349 Austin R. Reissner  
7428 Carl Parker III (by reciprocity)

Notification of applicants with substantively incomplete applications who have not responded to the Committee's request for additional information. Pursuant to R4-46-202(D) applicants have up to a year to meet all requirements for license/certificate or applicant's file is to be closed by the Board and applicant shall reapply.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

### *COMMITTEE ON APPRAISAL TESTING AND EDUCATION*

**TO: Board of Appraisal**

**FROM: Committee on Appraisal Testing and Education**

**DATE: September 18, 2008**

**RE: September 18, 2008 Recommendations**

**As a result of its September 18, 2008 meeting the Committee on Appraisal Testing and Education makes the following recommendations:**

- I. Action regarding correction of previously approved course:
  - A. Arizona Property Tax Conference
    - (1) **2008 Tax Conference**, #ABA 0807-683 9 hours  
\*Keith Russell, R.L. Brown, Kitty Decker, John Kendall, Val Courtwright, Marc Goldstone, Kenneth Vass, Caryn Tijsseling, Dean Martin, Harold Scott, Stacy Swanson, Ron Nickelson, David Whiterell, David Dermer, Harold Scott, Roberta Livesay, Stephen Wolf, Kenneth Love, Marci Williams, Todd Crabtree, Anthony Hagenstein  
Recommend approval
    - (2) **2008-2009 National USPAP Update**, 7 hours  
\*Keith Russell  
Recommend approval
    - (3) **IAAO Forum 909-Appraisal of Commercial Property in a Declining Market**, 7 hours  
\*Anthony Hagenstein  
Recommend approval
- II. Action regarding proposed approval of **qualifying education courses**:
  - A. **Previously approved by the Board:**
    - 1. Submitted by Appraisal Institute
      - a. **General Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use**, #ABA 1105-485-11 30 hours  
\*Vincent Dowling  
Recommend approval
      - b. **Online Residential Sales Comparison & Income Approach**, #ABA D1007-699-06  
Distance Education 30 hours  
\*Mark Ratterman  
Recommend approval

**III. Action regarding proposed approval of continuing education courses:**

**A. Previously approved by the Board:**

1. Submitted by Columbia Institute
  - a. **Survey of the Cost Approach, No. 106, #ABA 0907-694** 8 hours  
\*Raulie Irwin, Jr., Don Clark, Edmond Fisher, Ken Guilfoyle, James Reuss, Bernard Boarnet, Bobby Crisp, George Harrison, Dr. Samuel Henderson, Robert Hetrick, Ameria Lovern-Brown, Diana Jacobs, Marty Molloy, Bryan Reynolds, Roy Morris, Daniel Smith  
Recommend approval
2. Submitted by Hogan School of Real Estate
  - a. **Using the Internet for Disclosure of Material Facts, #ABA 1003-303** 3 hours  
\*Steve Cole  
Recommend approval

**B. Not previously approved by the Board:**

1. Submitted by Young & Associates R.E. Appraisal Co.
  - a. **Proving Trends & Adjustments with Graphs,** 7 hours  
\*Anthony Young  
Recommend approval
2. Submitted by Appraisal Institute
  - a. **Online Rates & Ratios: Marking Sense of GIM's, OAR's and DCF,** 7 hours  
Distance Education  
\*Kenneth Lusht  
Recommend approval
  - b. **Online Supervising Appraisal Trainees,** 4 hours  
Distance Education  
\*Sara Adomatie  
Recommend approval (tabled for corrections of recommendations)
3. Submitted by Appraisal Institute/Southern Arizona Chapter
  - a. **Building Green Goes Mainstream,** 3 hours  
\*Richard Michal, Adam Weinstein, J. Glynn Grass, Yves Khawam  
Recommend approval

**IV. Discussion and possible action regarding proposed approval of continuing education credit:**

1. Submitted by Arizona State University
  - a. Joseph M. Davis
    - (1) **RED 691: Advanced Real Estate Finance and Analysis,** 14 hours  
Recommend approval